Ш

G

 α

MONTHLY PERFORMANCE REPORT OF CAATS:

AUDITOR-CONTROLLER, HUMAN RESOURCES, & COUNTY EXECUTIVE OFFICE/PURCHASING

AUDIT FOR DUPLICATE VENDOR PAYMENTS AND OTHER PERIODIC ROUTINES

(Cited as a Best Practice by the Institute of Internal Auditors)

For the Month: December 2009

We analyzed 11,589 vendor invoices paid in November 2009 amounting to about \$154 million and found 99.95% of the invoices were only paid once.

Of the \$154 million vendor invoices, we identified 6 potential duplicate payments made to vendors totaling \$7,693.

To date we have identified \$896,826 in duplicate vendor payments, of which \$845,560 has been recovered.

AUDIT NO: 2941-F REPORT DATE: DECEMBER 28, 2009

Director: Dr. Peter Hughes, MBA, CPA, CIA Deputy Director: Eli Littner, CPA, CIA, CISA Senior Audit Manager: Autumn McKinney, CPA, CIA, CISA Audit Manager: Carol Swe, CPA, CIA, CISA



RISK BASED AUDITING

GAO & IIA Peer Review Compliant - 2001, 2004, 2007









GAO & IIA Peer Review Compliant - 2001, 2004, 2007

Providing Facts and Perspectives Countywide

RISK BASED AUDITING

Dr. Peter Hughes Ph.D., MBA, CPA, CCEP, CITP, CIA, CFE

Director Certified Compliance & Ethics Professional (CCEP)

Certified Information Technology Professional (CITP)

Certified Internal Auditor (CIA)
Certified Fraud Examiner (CFE)

E-mail: peter.hughes@iad.ocgov.com

Eli Littner CPA, CIA, CFE, CFS, CISA

Deputy Director Certified Fraud Specialist (CFS)

Certified Information Systems Auditor (CISA)

Michael J. Goodwin CPA, CIA

Senior Audit Manager

Alan Marcum MBA, CPA, CIA, CFE

Senior Audit Manager

Autumn McKinney CPA, CIA, CISA, CGFM

Senior Audit Manager Certified Government Financial Manager (CGFM)

Hall of Finance & Records

12 Civic Center Plaza, Room 232 Santa Ana, CA 92701

Phone: (714) 834-5475 Fax: (714) 834-2880

To access and view audit reports or obtain additional information about the OC Internal Audit Department, visit our website: www.ocgov.com/audit



OC Fraud Hotline (714) 834-3608

Letter from Director Peter Hughes





Transmittal Letter

Audit No. 2941-F December 28, 2009

TO: David Sundstrom, Auditor-Controller Carl Crown, Director, Human Resources Department Ronald C. Vienna, County Purchasing

Agent, County Purchasing
Agent, County Procurement Office

SUBJECT: Monthly Performance Report of CAATS:

Auditor-Controller, Human Resources, &

CEO/Purchasing - Duplicate Vendor Payments

and Other Periodic Routines

We have completed the December 2009 report of the results of our Computer-Assisted Audit Techniques (CAAT). The final report is attached for your information. Recoveries to date from duplicate vendor payments are \$845,560.

Each month I submit an **Audit Status Report** to the Board of Supervisors (BOS) where I detail any material and significant audit issues released in reports during the prior month and the implementation status of audit recommendations as disclosed by our Follow-Up Audits. Accordingly, the results of this audit will be included in a future status report to the BOS.

As always, the Internal Audit Department is available to partner with your staff so that they can successfully implement or mitigate difficult audit recommendations. Please feel free to call me should you wish to discuss any aspect of our audit report.

We appreciate the courtesy and cooperation extended to us by the personnel of the Auditor-Controller's Office and the Human Resources Department. If we can be of further assistance, please contact me or Eli Littner, Deputy Director at (714) 834-5899, or Autumn McKinney, Senior Audit Manager at (714) 834-6106.

Respectfully Submitted,

Dr. Peter Hughes, CPA, Director

Internal Audit Department

Attachment

Letter from Director Peter Hughes



Distribution Pursuant to Audit Oversight Committee Procedure No. 1:

Members, Board of Supervisors
Members, Audit Oversight Committee
Thomas G. Mauk, County Executive Officer
Jan Grimes, Director, Auditor-Controller/Central Accounting Operations
Robert Leblow, Senior Manager, Auditor-Controller/Claims & Disbursing Section
Bill Malohn, A-C/Information Technology/CAPS G/L System Support
Shelley Carlucci, Assistant Director, Human Resources/Administration
Bob Leys, Assistant Director, Human Resources/Services and Support
Rosie Santiesteban, Admin. Manager II, Human Resources/Administration
Laurence McCabe, Admin. Manager II, Human Resources
Foreperson, Grand Jury
Darlene J. Bloom, Clerk of the Board of Supervisors

Table of Contents



Monthly Performance Report of CAATS: Auditor-Controller, Human Resources, & CEO/Purchasing Duplicate Vendor Payments and Other Periodic Routines Audit No. 2941-F

For the Month: December 2009

Trans	mittal Letter	i
OC In	ternal Auditor's Report	1
OI	BJECTIVES	1
BA	ACKGROUND	1
SC	COPE	2
RI	ESULTS	2
DETA	ILED RESULTS	
1.	Duplicate Payments (Objective #1)	4
2.	Employee Vendor Match (Objective #2)	5
3.	OC Working Retiree/Extra Help Hours (Objective #3)	5
4.	Payroll Direct Deposits (Objective #4)	6

OC Internal Auditor's Report



Audit No. 2941-F

December 28, 2009

TO: David Sundstrom, Auditor-Controller

Carl Crown, Director, Human Resources Department

Ronald C. Vienna, County Purchasing Agent

County Procurement Office

FROM: Dr. Peter Hughes, CPA, Director

Internal Audit Department

SUBJECT: Monthly Performance Report of CAATS:

Auditor-Controller, Human Resources, &

CEO/Purchasing - Duplicate Vendor Payments and

Other Periodic Routines

Audit Highlight

We analyzed 11,589 vendor invoices paid in November 2009 amounting to about \$154 million and found 99.95% of the invoices were only paid once.

Of the \$154 million vendor invoices, we identified 6 potential duplicate payments made to vendors totaling \$7,693.

To date we have identified \$896,826 in duplicate vendor payments, of which \$845,560 has been recovered.

OBJECTIVES

Each month, the Internal Audit Department conducts a variety of performance reviews of vendor payment and payroll activity utilizing Computer-Assisted Audit Techniques (known by the acronym CAAT). Our objectives are to analyze the selected vendor payment and payroll data to identify:

- 1. **Duplicate Payments:** Duplicate payments made to vendors. This CAAT is performed monthly.
- 2. **Employee Vendor Match:** Employees that bought goods or issued contracts to themselves or a related vendor. This CAAT is currently performed quarterly.
- 3. **OC Working Retiree/Extra Help Hours:** County retirees working as extra help in excess of mandated hour limits of 960 or 720 hours for FY 09-10. The mandated limits are per fiscal year and this CAAT is performed monthly and annually.
- 4. **Payroll Direct Deposits:** Multiple employee paychecks directly deposited to the same bank account which could be an indicator of inappropriate payments. This CAAT is performed monthly.

BACKGROUND

CAATs are automated queries applied to large amounts of electronic data searching for specified characteristics. We use a proprietary, best practices and industry recognized software product to help us in this process.

CAATs differ from our traditional audits in that CAATs can query **100%** of a data universe whereas the traditional audits typically test but a **sample** of transactions from the population.

OC Internal Auditor's Report



Resulting exceptions or findings are forwarded to the appropriate department for validation and/or resolution. Depending on the department's review, the exceptions may or may not be a finding.

Often there is additional data needed to validate the exception that is only known at the department level. We also partner with the departments to identify internal control enhancements with the purpose of preventing future occurrences of the type of findings identified by the CAATs.

We are keeping the details of our process and the vulnerabilities identified to a general discussion because of the risks associated with disclosing specific details of our financial and accounting processes.

SCOPE

This report details the CAAT work we performed in December 2009. Our analysis included a review of the following data:

- 1. **Duplicate Payments:** 11,589 vendor invoices totaling \$153,958,705 for potential duplicate payments.
- 2. **Employee Vendor Match:** Employee and vendor addresses at 6/30/09 and 9/30/09 and employee and vendor phone numbers at 9/30/09 for potential conflicts of interest (perform quarterly).
- 3. **OC Working Retiree/Extra Help Hours:** County working retiree/extra help hours worked as of 11/30/09 for individuals exceeding annual limits of 960 or 720 hours for FY 09-10.
- 4. **Payroll Direct Deposits:** 37,271 payroll direct deposit transactions processed for pay periods 23 (10/23/09 11/5/09), 24 (11/6/09 11/1909) for suspicious direct deposit activity.

RESULTS

For the month of December 2009, we found the following:

Objective #1 - Duplicate Payments:

We identified six (6) duplicate payments made to vendors totaling **\$7,693** or **.005%** of the **\$154 million** of vendor invoices processed during November 2009.

Value-added Information

Based on the to-date recoveries of **\$845,560** from the duplicate vendor payment routine, these computer assisted routines have paid for themselves and are returning monies to the County that may otherwise be lost. To date, we have issued 91 monthly performance reports for the CAATs.

Objective #2 – Employee Vendor Match:

In November 2009, we identified **7** potential employee/vendor matches and have submitted them to Human Resources for further evaluation. Their review is in process.

OC Internal Auditor's Report



- Objective #3 OC Working Retiree/Extra Help Hours:
 As of 11/30/09, no working retirees have exceeded the annual limits of 960 or 720 hours for FY 09/10.
- Objective #4 Payroll Direct Deposits: Analysis performed with no findings noted.

See the Detailed Results section for further information.

Detailed Results



1. Duplicate Payments (Objective #1)

We used a CAAT routine to identify potential duplicate payments made to vendors during November 2009.

A. Results

We identified six (6) duplicate payments totaling \$7,693 or .005% of the \$154 million of vendor invoices processed during November 2009. We have communicated the duplicate payments to the Auditor-Controller. The Auditor-Controller continues to investigate all duplicate payments and is pursuing collection. Currently, the Auditor-Controller has a recovery rate of about 95% on these duplicate payments that we have brought to their attention since the inception of the CAAT routines.

The table below summarizes the duplicate payment activity to date:

	Not			Not				
CAAT Report	Total		Duplicates		Recovered		In Process	
	#'s	\$'s	#'s	\$'s	#'s	\$'s	#'s	\$'s
2002	103	\$99,980	19	\$10,334	80	\$87,808	4	\$1,838
2003	50	\$33,306	7	\$10,175	39	\$21,020	4	\$2,111
2004	33	\$105,779	7	\$2,990	24	\$101,460	2	\$1,329
2005	67	\$80,162	2	\$668	64	\$78,472	1	\$1,022
2006	75	\$347,008	16	\$33,720	54	\$310,019	5	\$3,269
2007	93	\$99,999	12	\$8,411	76	\$88,735	5	\$2,853
2008	70	\$77,712	11	\$6,794	54	\$67,780	5	\$3,138
January 2009	2	\$1,293	0	\$0	2	\$1,293	0	\$0
February 2009	2	\$3,991	1	\$3,799	1	\$192	0	\$0
March 2009	8	\$33,843	3	\$625	5	\$33,218	0	\$0
April 2009	3	\$5,861	0	\$0	3	\$5,861	0	\$0
May 2009	0	\$0	0	\$0	0	\$0	0	\$0
June 2009	0	\$0	0	\$0	0	\$0	0	\$0
July 2009	28	\$29,660	0	\$0	28	\$29,660	0	\$0
August 2009	10	\$29,441	2	\$23,672	4	\$3,860	4	\$1,909
September 2009	29	\$23,033	1	\$1,391	18	\$12,103	10	\$9,539
October 2009	6	\$7,770	0	\$0	1	\$4,079	5	\$3,691
November 2009	6	\$12,944	1	\$70	0	\$0	5	\$12,874
December 2009	6	\$7,693	0	\$0	0	\$0	6	\$7,693
TOTAL	591	\$999,475	82	\$102,649	453	\$845,560	56	\$51,266

B. Background

This CAAT routine concentrates on a sub-set of vendor invoices paid by the County that possesses certain common attributes. The sub-set excludes one-time payments (such as election worker pay, jury duty pay, etc.) as well as recurring payments (periodic payments to the same payee for the same amount such as welfare, family support, etc.).

Detailed Results



During the month of December 2009, 11,589 invoices for \$153,958,705 were added to this data sub-set representing November 2009 transactions. Currently, the data sub-set includes 961,345 invoices totaling \$9,866,379,237.

The total data file from which the sub-set is derived includes 2,879,843 records totaling \$19,429,011,506. For FY 08-09, established vendor payments were about \$1.1 billion.

Our prior research has indicated that the duplicate payments are typically caused by a compounded human clerical error.

2. Employee Vendor Match (Objective #2)

We used a CAAT routine to identify employees that share a similar address as a vendor. This may identify employees buying goods or issuing contracts to themselves or a related vendor.

Status:

This routine is performed quarterly. In November 2009, we performed an analysis of employee and vendor addresses at 6/30/09 and 9/30/09 as well as an analysis of employee and vendor phone numbers at 9/30/09. In November 2009, we identified **7** potential employee-vendor matches. Our results were provided to the Human Resources Department (HR) for their evaluation as to whether any employee vendor conflicts exist in the matches identified. HR's review is currently in process.

		HR Disposition				
CAAT Report Month	Matches Submitted to HR	In Progress	Not a Valid Match	No Conflict Exists	No Conflict – Potential HR Policy Issue Resolved to HR's Satisfaction	Conflict – Issue Resolved to HR's Satisfaction
November 2009	7	7	0	0	0	0
TOTAL	7	7	0	0	0	0

3. OC Working Retiree/Extra Help Hours (Objective #3)

We performed an analysis of working retiree hours to identify retirees working as extra help in excess of mandated limits.

Our criteria are 960 hours (maximum allowed for regular retirees) or 720 hours (maximum for early retirees) during the fiscal year (FY).

Detailed Results



Status:

The mandated limit is per fiscal year and we perform this review monthly. To date in FY 09-10, there have been approximately 103 OC working retirees; non-County working retirees are excluded from these totals (e.g. Superior Court, OCERS, LAFCO, etc.). As of November 30, 2009, no individuals have exceeded the annual limits for FY 09-10.

For FY 09-10, OC working retiree/extra-help data as of November 30, 2009 is:

	No. of OC Working	Total FY
Department	Retirees	Hours to Date
Sheriff-Coroner	74	12,722
Assessor	17	4,245
Health Care Agency	7	2,256
County Executive Office	2	680
OC Public Works	1	440
County Counsel	1	396
District Attorney	1	175
Total	103	20,914

4. Payroll Direct Deposits (Objective #4)

We used a CAAT to identify multiple employee paychecks directly deposited to the same bank account in the same pay period. We review results to determine there has been no irregular direct deposit activity. For FY 08-09, direct deposits for payroll were about \$1.3 billion.

Results:

This CAAT was applied in December 2009 with no significant findings.

Attachments:

Provided to the Auditor-Controller: dated 12/8/09 – A-C/Claims & Disbursing Section.