⋖ 2 0

RESULTS OF CONTINUOUS AUDITING USING CAATS:

AUDITOR-CONTROLLER, HUMAN RESOURCES, & COUNTY PROCUREMENT OFFICE

AUDIT FOR DUPLICATE VENDOR PAYMENTS AND OTHER PERIODIC ROUTINES

(Cited as a Best Practice by the Institute of Internal Auditors)

For the Month: July 2012

<u>Duplicate Vendor Payments</u>: We analyzed 31,869 vendor invoices paid in June 2012 amounting to about \$202 million and found 99.99% of the invoices were paid only once. Of the \$202 million vendor invoices, we identified two (2) potential duplicate payments made to vendors totaling \$315.

To date we have identified \$983,910 in duplicate vendor payments, of which \$973,068 or 99% has been recovered.

<u>Working Retirees</u>: For FY 11-12, no OC working retirees exceeded the annual fiscal year limit of 960 hours.

AUDIT NO: 1238-A REPORT DATE: JULY 31, 2012

Director: Dr. Peter Hughes, MBA, CPA, CIA Deputy Director: Eli Littner, CPA, CIA, CISA Senior Audit Manager: Autumn McKinney, CPA, CIA, CISA Audit Manager: Carol Swe, CPA, CIA, CISA

RISK BASED AUDITING

GAO & IIA Peer Review Compliant - 2001, 2004, 2007, 2010

American Institute of Certified Public Accountants Award to Dr. Peter Hughes as 2010 Outstanding CPA of the Year for Local Government

GRC (Government, Risk & Compliance) Group 2010 Award to IAD as MVP in Risk Management





2008 Association of Local Government Auditors' Bronze Website Award



GAO & IIA Peer Review Compliant - 2001, 2004, 2007, 2010

Providing Facts and Perspectives Countywide

RISK BASED AUDITING

Dr. Peter Hughes Ph.D., MBA, CPA, CCEP, CITP, CIA, CFE, CFF, CGMA

Director Certified Compliance & Ethics Professional (CCEP)

Certified Information Technology Professional (CITP)

Certified Internal Auditor (CIA)
Certified Fraud Examiner (CFE)
Certified in Financial Forensics (CFF)

Chartered Global Management Accountant (CGMA)

E-mail: peter.hughes@iad.ocgov.com

Eli Littner CPA, CIA, CFE, CFS, CISA

Deputy Director Certified Fraud Specialist (CFS)

Certified Information Systems Auditor (CISA)

Michael J. Goodwin CPA, CIA

Senior Audit Manager

Alan Marcum MBA, CPA, CIA, CFE

Senior Audit Manager

Autumn McKinney CPA, CIA, CISA, CGFM

Senior Audit Manager Certified Government Financial Manager (CGFM)

Hall of Finance & Records

12 Civic Center Plaza, Room 232 Santa Ana, CA 92701

Phone: (714) 834-5475 Fax: (714) 834-2880

To access and view audit reports or obtain additional information about the OC Internal Audit Department, visit our website: www.ocgov.com/audit



OC Fraud Hotline (714) 834-3608

Letter from Director Peter Hughes



Transmittal Letter



Audit No. 1238-A July 31, 2012

TO: Jan Grimes, Chief Deputy Auditor-Controller Steve Danley, Director

Human Resources Department

Ronald C. Vienna, County Purchasing Agent

County Procurement Office

SUBJECT: Results of Continuous Auditing Using CAATS:

Auditor-Controller, Human Resources, & County Procurement Office – Duplicate Vendor Payments & Other Routines

We have completed the July 2012 report of Results of Continuous Auditing Using CAATS (Computer-Assisted Audit Techniques). The final report is attached for your information. Recoveries to date from duplicate vendor payments are \$973,068.

Each month I submit an **Audit Status Report** to the Board of Supervisors (BOS) where I detail any material and significant audit issues released in reports during the prior month and the implementation status of audit recommendations as disclosed by our Follow-Up Audits. Accordingly, the results of this audit will be included in a future status report to the BOS.

As always, the Internal Audit Department is available to partner with your staff so that they can successfully implement or mitigate difficult audit recommendations. Please feel free to call me should you wish to discuss any aspect of our audit report.

We appreciate the courtesy and cooperation extended to us by the personnel of your offices. If we can be of further assistance, please contact me or Eli Littner, Deputy Director at (714) 834-5899, or Autumn McKinney, Senior Audit Manager at (714) 834-6106.

Respectfully Submitted.

Dr. Peter Hughes, CPA, Director

Internal Audit Department

Attachment

Letter from Director Peter Hughes



Distribution Pursuant to Audit Oversight Committee Procedure No. 1:

Members, Board of Supervisors
Members, Audit Oversight Committee
Thomas G. Mauk, County Executive Officer
Bob Franz, Chief Financial Officer, CEO/Office of Finance
Victoria Ross, Senior Manager, Auditor-Controller/Claims & Disbursing Section
Bill Malohn, A-C/Information Technology/CAPS G/L System Support
Bob Leys, Assistant Director, Human Resources/Services and Support
Rosie Santiesteban, Administrative Manager, Human Resources/Administration
Foreperson, Grand Jury
Susan Novak, Clerk of the Board of Supervisors

Table of Contents



Results of Continuous Auditing Using CAATS: Auditor-Controller, Human Resources, & County Procurement Office Duplicate Vendor Payments and Other Routines Audit No. 1238-A

For the Month: July 2012

Transmittal Letter	i
OC Internal Auditor's Report	1
OBJECTIVES	1
BACKGROUND	2
SCOPE	2
RESULTS	3
DETAILED RESULTS	
1. DUPLICATE PAYMENTS (OBJECTIVE #1)	4
2. EMPLOYEE VENDOR MATCH (OBJECTIVE #2)	5
3. OC WORKING RETIREE/EXTRA HELP HOURS (OBJECTIVE #3)	5
4. PAYROLL DIRECT DEPOSITS (OBJECTIVE #4)	6

OC Internal Auditor's Report



Audit No. 1238-A

July 31, 2012

TO: Jan Grimes, Chief Deputy Auditor-Controller

Steve Danley, Director, Human Resources Department

Ronald C. Vienna, County Purchasing Agent

County Procurement Office

FROM: Dr. Peter Hughes, CPA, Director

Internal Audit Department

SUBJECT: Results of Continuous Auditing Using CAATS:

Auditor-Controller, Human Resources, & County Procurement

Office - Duplicate Vendor Payments and Other Routines

Audit Highlight

We analyzed 31,869 vendor invoices paid in June 2012 amounting to about \$202 million and found 99.99% of the invoices were only paid once.

Of the \$202 million vendor invoices, we identified two (2) potential duplicate payments made to vendors totaling \$315.

To date we have identified \$983,910 in duplicate vendor payments, of which \$973,068 or 99% has been recovered.

OBJECTIVES

Each month, the Internal Audit Department conducts a variety of continuous auditing of vendor payment and payroll activity utilizing Computer-Assisted Audit Techniques (known by the acronym CAAT). Our objectives are to analyze selected vendor payment and payroll data to identify:

- 1. **Duplicate Payments:** Duplicate payments made to vendors. This CAAT is performed monthly.
- 2. **Employee Vendor Match:** Employees that bought goods or issued contracts to themselves or a related vendor. This CAAT is performed quarterly.
- OC Working Retiree/Extra Help Hours: County retirees working as extra help in excess of mandated hour limits of 960 or 720 hours for FY 11-12. The mandated limits required by Government Code Sections 31680.6 and 31641.04 are per fiscal year and this CAAT is performed monthly and annually.
- 4. **Payroll Direct Deposits:** Multiple employee paychecks directly deposited to the same bank account which could be an indicator of inappropriate payments. This CAAT is performed monthly.

OC Internal Auditor's Report



BACKGROUND

Continuous auditing is a change to the traditional audit approach of periodic reviews of a sample of transactions to ongoing audit testing of 100 percent of transactions. Continuous auditing provides efficient and timely testing of transactions and/or controls to allow immediate notification and remediation by management. An important component of continuous auditing is the development of models for the ongoing (continuous) review of transactions at, or close to, the point at which they occur.

As a supplement to traditional audits performed, Internal Audit performs continuous auditing of selected vendor payment and payroll activities utilizing Computer Assisted Audit Techniques (CAATs).

CAATs are automated queries applied to large amounts of electronic data searching for specified characteristics. We use a proprietary, best practices and industry recognized software product to help us in this process.

CAATs differ from our traditional audits in that CAATs can query **100%** of a data universe whereas the traditional audits typically test but a **sample** of transactions from the population.

Resulting exceptions or findings are forwarded to the appropriate department for validation and/or resolution. Depending on the department's review, the exceptions may or may not be a finding.

Often there is additional data needed to validate the exception that is only known at the department level. We also partner with the departments to identify internal control enhancements with the purpose of preventing future occurrences of the type of findings identified by the CAATs.

We are keeping the details of our process and the vulnerabilities identified to a general discussion because of the risks associated with disclosing specific details of our financial and accounting processes.

SCOPE

This report details the CAAT work we performed in July 2012. Our analysis included a review of the following data:

- 1. **Duplicate Payments:** 31,869 vendor invoices totaling \$201,613,356 for potential duplicate payments.
- 2. **Employee Vendor Match:** 39,847 employee and 16,405 vendor addresses and phone numbers at June 30, 2102 for potential matches.
- 3. **OC Working Retiree/Extra Help Hours:** County working retiree/extra help hours worked during FY 11-12 for individuals exceeding annual fiscal year limits of 960 or 720 hours, as mandated by Government Code Sections 31680.6 and 31641.04.
- 4. **Payroll Direct Deposits:** 36,055 payroll direct deposit transactions processed for pay periods #12 (5/18/12 5/31/12) and #13 (6/1/12 6/14/12) for suspicious direct deposit activity.

OC Internal Auditor's Report



RESULTS

For the month of July 2012, we found the following:

Objective #1 - Duplicate Payments:

We identified two (2) duplicate payments made to vendors totaling \$315 of the **\$202 million** of vendor invoices processed during June 2012.

Value-added Information

Based on the to-date recoveries of \$973,068 from the duplicate vendor payment routine, these computer assisted routines have paid for themselves and are returning monies to the County that may otherwise be lost. To date, we have issued 122 monthly performance reports for the CAATs.

Objective #2 – Employee Vendor Match:

This routine is performed on a quarterly basis. At June 30, 2012, one (1) potential employee-vendor conflict was identified in the employee-vendor matches we reviewed. This one match has been submitted to Human Resources Department (HRD) for further evaluation.

■ Objective #3 – OC Working Retiree/Extra Help Hours:

During FY 11-12, no OC working retirees exceeded the annual fiscal year limits of 960 or 720 hours mandated by Government Code Sections 31680.6 and 31641.04.

■ Objective #4 – Payroll Direct Deposits:

Analysis performed with no findings noted.

See the Detailed Results section for further information.

Detailed Results



1. Duplicate Payments (Objective #1)

We used a CAAT routine to identify potential duplicate payments made to vendors during June 2012.

A. Results

We identified two (2) potential duplicate payments made to vendors totaling \$315 or .0002% of the \$202 million of vendor invoices processed during June 2012. The Auditor-Controller continues to investigate all duplicate payments and is pursuing collection. Currently, the County has a recovery rate of about **99%** on these duplicate payments that have been identified since the inception of the CAAT routines.

The table below summarizes the duplicate payment activity to date:

		Total	Not Duplicates		Recovered		In Process	
CAAT Report	#'s	\$'s	#'s	\$'s	#'s	\$'s	#'s	\$'s
2002	103	\$99,980	19	\$10,334	80	\$87,808	4	\$1,838
2003	50	\$33,306	7	\$10,175	39	\$21,020	4	\$2,111
2004	33	\$105,779	7	\$2,990	24	\$101,460	2	\$1,329
2005	67	\$80,162	2	\$668	64	\$78,472	1	\$1,022
2006	75	\$347,008	16	\$33,720	56	\$311,421	3	\$1,867
2007	93	\$99,999	12	\$8,411	78	\$90,920	3	\$668
2008	70	\$77,712	11	\$6,794	58	\$70,718	1	\$200
2009	100	\$155,529	10	\$30,173	90	\$125,356	0	\$0
2010	40	\$84,059	7	\$8,050	29	\$74,517	4	\$1,492
2011	22	\$9,351	0	\$0	22	\$9,351	0	\$0
January 2012	2	\$1,200	0	\$0	2	\$1,200	0	\$0
February 2012	4	\$165	0	\$0	4	\$165	0	\$0
March 2012	2	\$360	0	\$0	2	\$360	0	\$0
April 2012	1	\$300	0	\$0	1	\$300	0	\$0
May 2012	0	\$0	0	\$0	0	\$0	0	\$0
June 2012	0	\$0	0	\$0	0	\$0	0	\$0
July 2012	2	\$315	0	\$0	0	\$0	2	\$315
TOTAL	664	\$1,095,225	91	\$111,315	549	\$973,068	24	\$10,842

B. Background

This CAAT routine concentrates on a sub-set of vendor invoices paid by the County that possesses certain common attributes. The sub-set excludes one-time payments (such as election worker pay, jury duty pay, etc.) as well as recurring payments (periodic payments to the same payee for the same amount such as welfare, family support, etc.).

During the month of July 2012, 31,869 invoices for \$201,613,356 were added to this data sub-set representing June 2012 transactions. Currently, the data sub-set includes 1,075,288 invoices totaling \$11,391,917,706. The total data file from which the sub-set is derived includes 2,414,884 records totaling \$25,469,583,450. For FY 10-11, established vendor payments were about \$2.4 billion.

Our prior research has indicated that the duplicate payments are typically caused by a compounded human clerical error.

Detailed Results



2. Employee Vendor Match (Objective #2)

We used a CAAT routine to identify employees that share a similar address or phone number as a vendor. This may identify employees buying goods or issuing contracts to themselves or a related vendor. This routine is performed quarterly.

Status:

We performed an analysis of employee and vendor addresses and phone numbers at quarter-end June 30, 2012. We identified one (1) potential employee-vendor conflict in the employee-vendor matches we reviewed. This match has been submitted to the Human Resources Department (HRD) for further evaluation. Our next analysis will be performed at quarter-end September 30, 2012.

3. OC Working Retiree/Extra Help Hours (Objective #3)

We performed an analysis of working retiree hours to identify retirees working as extra help in excess of Government Code Sections 31680.6 and 31641.04 mandated limits. Our criteria are 960 hours (maximum allowed for regular retirees) or 720 hours (maximum for early retirees) during the fiscal year (FY) 2011-2012.

Status:

The Government Code Section 31680.6 and 31641.04 mandated limits are per fiscal year and we perform this review monthly. The County's timekeeping system (VTI) automatically alerts the working retiree and their supervisor when the working retiree is approaching the mandated limit. In FY 11-12, there were 168 OC working retirees with hours; non-County working retirees are excluded from these totals (e.g. Superior Court, OCERS, LAFCO, etc.). During FY 11-12, no OC working retiree exceeded the annual fiscal year limits.

For FY 11-12, OC working retiree/extra-help hours were:

Department	No. of OC Working Retirees	FY 11-12 Final Hours
Sheriff-Coroner	92	54,392
District Attorney	29	17,655
Health Care Agency	15	7,614
Assessor	12	7,196
Probation	9	5,283
OC Public Works	2	1,854
County Counsel	2	1,683
Treasurer-Tax Collector	1	899
Auditor-Controller	1	688
Social Services Agency	2	501
Human Resources	2	488
Child Support Services	1	460
Clerk of the Board	1	166
John Wayne Airport	1	133
Total	170	99,012

Detailed Results



4. Payroll Direct Deposits (Objective #4)

We used a CAAT to identify multiple employee paychecks directly deposited to the same bank account in the same pay period. We review results to determine there has been no irregular direct deposit activity. For FY 10-11, direct deposits for regular payroll were about \$1.3 billion.

Results:

This CAAT was applied in July 2012 with no significant findings.

Attachments:

Details of Duplicate Payments provided to the Auditor-Controller/Claims & Disbursing Section, dated July 6, 2012.